Renormalized Resonance Quartets in Dispersive Wave Turbulence

Wonjung Lee,1 Gregor Kovačić,2 and David Cai1,3,*

1Courant Institute of Mathematical Sciences, New York University, 251 Mercer Street, New York, New York 10012, USA
2Mathematical Sciences Department, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, 110 8th Street, Troy, New York 12180, USA
3Mathematics Department, Shanghai Jiao Tong University, Shanghai 200240, China

(Received 15 December 2008; published 7 July 2009)

Using the (1 + 1)D Majda-McLaughlin-Tabak model as an example, we present an extension of the wave turbulence (WT) theory to systems with strong nonlinearities. We demonstrate that nonlinear wave interactions renormalize the dynamics, leading to (i) a possible destruction of scaling structures in the bare wave systems and a drastic deformation of the resonant manifold even at weak nonlinearities, and (ii) creation of nonlinear resonance quartets in wave systems for which there would be no resonances as predicted by the linear dispersion relation. Finally, we derive an effective WT kinetic equation and show that our prediction of the renormalized Rayleigh-Jeans distribution is in excellent agreement with the simulation of the full wave system in equilibrium.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.103.024502
PACS numbers: 47.27.eb, 05.20.Dd, 47.27.ek, 52.35.Mw

For many wave phenomena, due to their inherent complexity and turbulent nature, statistical ensembles rather than individual wave trajectories render the natural observables. In numerous branches of physics, including surface waves, capillary waves, internal waves, waves on liquid ables. In numerous branches of physics, including surface waves, capillary waves, internal waves, waves on liquid turbulence in nonlinear optics, wave turbulence (WT) [1–3] arises through interactions of weakly nonlinear resonant waves in a dispersive medium. In contrast to strong turbulence in incompressible fluids, the weak nonlinearity in waves in a dispersive medium. The resulting kinetic equation in WT theory captures the time evolution of wave action [3]. In addition to the equilibrium Rayleigh-Jeans (RJ) distribution, there are Zakharov-Kolmogorov stationary solutions [3] to the kinetic equation for homogeneous, scale-invariant wave systems, which capture the direct and inverse cascades of wave excitations. These were believed to be universal (i.e., independent of the details of driving and damping) nonequilibrium spectra in an inertial range where neither driving nor damping exists.

Invoking random phase approximation (RPA), near Gaussianity in wave statistics (so no coherent structures) and resonant wave-wave interactions, WT theory was formally developed for describing the long-time statistical behavior of waves. Yet a major question remains, namely, how well it can describe real wave systems. Many studies attempted to verify the results of WT theory using direct numerical simulations of the underlying wave equations, but careful examination of the validity conditions of WT theory is further needed, in particular, on questions of what happens if any of the assumptions leading to WT theory are violated. This requires careful analysis of the related wave and (integro-differential) kinetic equations, with accurate simulations for precise statistical convergence. For (1 + 1)D dispersive waves, this was carried out by intro-
often coexist, spectra, including one apparently inconsistent with WT theory, as well as coherent structures, such as solitons, quasisolitons, and collapses, which greatly complicate the WT picture of the MMT system. Studies of this model thus show that, even in the weakly nonlinear limit, WT theory may not be able to capture fully the rich behavior of the nonlinear wave system \[6,7\].

Since the longtime statistical behavior of the nonlinear system is often controlled by resonances, WT theory focuses on the resonant wave interactions \[3\] determined by the linear dispersion relation \(\omega_k = \omega(k)\):

\[
\Delta_{kk_1k_2}^{k_3k_4} = k_1 + k_2 - k_3 - k_4 = 0, \quad (3a)
\]

\[
\Delta_{\omega_k\omega_k}^{\omega_k\omega_k} = \omega_k - \omega_{k_1} - \omega_{k_3} - \omega_{k_4} = 0. \quad (3b)
\]

WT theory assumes that waves interact weakly, and thus, in equilibrium, give rise to the RJ distribution—a stationary solution of the kinetic equation, independent of the details of the nonlinearity \[3\]. However, nonlinear wave interactions tend to renormalize dispersion relations \[8\], which may have a strong impact on wave-wave interactions and resonant structures. Using the MMT system as a WT model, we investigate the consequences of dispersion renormalization for resonant wave interactions in both weakly and strongly nonlinear limits.

We first show that, in equilibrium, the Zwanzig-Mori (ZM) theory \[9\] can successfully describe how the dispersion relation is renormalized for long waves. This theory yields a generalized Langevin equation governing effective dynamics of slow observables. For a single dynamical variable \(a_k(t)\), this exact Langevin equation is given by

\[
\frac{\partial a_k(t)}{\partial t} = -i\Omega_k a_k(t) - \int_0^t K(t-s)\frac{\partial a_k(s)}{\partial s}ds + F_k(t),
\]

where \(K\) is the random force related to the memory kernel \(\mathbf{K}\) by the fluctuation-dissipation theorem \[9\]. Using the equipartition theorem \(\langle a_k^* \mathcal{H} / \partial a_k \rangle\), where \(\mathcal{H}\) is the temperature of the MMT system, and \(\langle \cdot \rangle\) denotes the average over the Gibbs measure \(e^{-\beta H}\), we can show that the effective dispersion relation is

\[
\Omega_k = \frac{\theta}{\langle |a_k|^2 \rangle} = \frac{|k|^{\alpha} + |k|^{\beta/4}}{\langle |a_k|^2 \rangle} \\
\times \int |k_1 k_2 k_3|^{\beta/4} \frac{\langle a_k a_{k_1} a_{k_2} a_{k_3}^* \rangle}{\langle |a_k|^2 \rangle} \delta(\Delta_{k_1 k_2}^{k_3 k_4})dk_1 dk_2 dk_3 dk_4.
\]

The renormalized ZM dispersion \(\Omega_k\) further reduces to

\[
\Omega_k = |k|^{\alpha} + \left( 2 \int |k'|^{\beta/2} \langle |a_{k'}|^2 \rangle dk' \right) |k|^{\beta/4}
\]

by RPA. Via \(\Omega_{k'} = \theta/\langle |a_{k'}|^2 \rangle\), Eq. (5) becomes

\[
\Omega_k = |k|^{\alpha} + \theta(2 \int |k'|^{\beta/2} \Omega_{k'}^{-1} dk') |k|^{\beta/4},
\]

from which \(\Omega_k\) and \(\theta\) can be determined after invoking the conservation of wave action, \(\int |a_{k'}|^2 dk' = N\), i.e., \(\theta = \Omega_k' \langle |a_{k'}|^2 \rangle\), where \(N\) is set by the initial condition. The connection between this renormalized dispersion and wave interactions can be seen by considering the collective effect of the trivial resonances, i.e., \(k_1 = k_3\) or \(k_1 = k_4\) in conditions (3). More precisely, the trivial resonant terms in \(\mathcal{H}_d^\alpha = 2 \int |k'|^{\beta/2} |k|^{\beta/2} \langle |a_{k'}|^2 \rangle a_k^2 dk' dk\), can be approximated by \(\mathcal{H}_d^\alpha = \int (2 \int |k'|^{\beta/2} \langle |a_{k'}|^2 \rangle dk') |k|^{\beta/2} \langle a_k^2 \rangle dk\). Hence, the dispersion relation (5). Therefore, the longtime dynamics can be described by an effective Hamiltonian \(\mathcal{H}_d^\alpha = \mathcal{H}_d^\alpha + \mathcal{H}_d - \mathcal{H}_d^\alpha\), with \(\mathcal{H}_d - \mathcal{H}_d^\alpha\) representing the nonlinear interactions. This dispersion renormalization, arising from trivial resonant interactions, effectively weakens the averaged nonlinear interactions. Note that Eq. (5), which is not limited to weak nonlinearities, is a nonperturbative generalization of the perturbatively corrected dispersion relation for weak nonlinearities \[5,11\].

We now turn to the examination of our predictions (4) and (5). We numerically solve Eq. (2) \[12,14\] to obtain the spatiotemporal spectrum \(\langle \hat{a}_k(t) \rangle^2\) in equilibrium, where \(\hat{a}_k(t)\) is the Fourier transform of \(a_k(t)\). The peak locations, \(\omega_k^\text{meas}\), of \(\langle \hat{a}_k(t) \rangle^2\) can be viewed as the effective oscillation frequency of \(a_k(t)\). Figure 1 displays the result for \(\alpha = 1/2\) and \(\beta = 6\), the inset for \(\alpha = 2\) and \(\beta = 0\) (NLS) where the correction to \(\omega_k\) is an additive constant. In general, we find that, among the three dispersion relations, the ZM dispersion relation \(\Omega_k\) agrees best with the measured \(\omega_k^\text{meas}\).

The results are presented in Fig. 1 (color online). Measured \(\omega_k^\text{meas}\), the bare \(\omega_k = |k|^{\alpha}\), Eq. (4) and (5) with \(\alpha = 1/2, \beta = 6\), are depicted as solid, dotted, dashed, and dashed-dotted lines, respectively. \(N = 1024\). Inset: The same for NLS (\(\alpha = 2, \beta = 0\)).
stress that the RPA in $\tilde{\Omega}_k (5)$ is appealing in that it not only agrees well with numerical results, but also gives a clear, intuitive physical mechanism for the renormalization. It is important to point out that, unlike the Fermi-Pasta-Ulam chains [8], the renormalized wave frequency of the MMT system, in general, is not a simple rescaling of the bare $\omega_k = |k|^\alpha$. The case in Fig. 1 is characterized by the geometric shift from the overall concavity of the bare $\omega_k = |k|^{1/2}$ to the convexity of the renormalized curves at high $k$’s. This qualitative change of the dispersion relation takes place whenever $\alpha < 1$ and $\beta/2 > 1$, as seen in Eqs. (4) and (5), which generalizes, to strong nonlinearity, the corresponding results at weak nonlinearity [5]. It is important to note that the renormalization correction is $O(|k|^\beta/2)$, which can always dominate over the bare dispersion relation $\omega_k = |k|^\alpha$ for large $k$’s if $\beta/2 > \alpha$, no matter how small the nonlinearity. Furthermore, except for $\beta = 2\alpha$, the scaling structures in the bare dynamics (1) are destroyed by renormalization even at weak nonlinearities, thus, giving rise to a new resonance manifold not determined by the original scaling symmetry, as discussed below.

The theoretic resonance structure (3) can be visualized by projecting

$$\left| \Delta_{\omega_1,\omega_2} \right| = |\omega_{k_1} + \omega_{k_2} - \omega_{k_1} - \omega_{k_2}|$$

on $(k_1, k_2)$ with $k_3$ being fixed and $k_4$ from (3a). Figures 2(a)–2(c) display surface plots of (6) for the bare $\omega_k = |k|^\alpha$, and the renormalized $\omega_k = \tilde{\Omega}_k$ (note that using $\tilde{\Omega}_k$ gives similar results) for $\beta = 4$ [Fig. 2(b)] and $\beta = 8$ [Fig. 2(c)], respectively. In these figures, the resonance manifold determined by $\left| \Delta_{\omega_1,\omega_2} \right| = 0$, as signified by the dark strips, undergoes a deformation as $\beta$ increases and the resonance structures determined by the renormalized $\tilde{\Omega}_k$ are clearly different from those by the bare $\omega_k$. To approximate the MMT model, we use $N$ Fourier modes, and move all to the first Brillouin zone. The resonances within the area in Fig. 2(a) bounded by the two dashed lines are system intrinsic, i.e., not caused by the periodicity of the finite system.

In the traditional WT theory, waves interact through resonances controlled by the bare $\omega_k$. Here, we demonstrate a different picture. Since the resonances control the contribution of terms such as $a_{k_1} a_{k_2} a_{k_3}^* a_{k_4}^* \delta(\Delta_{k_1 k_2})$ in the longtime limit, we use the longtime average

$$\mathcal{A}_{k_1 k_2 k_3 k_4} = \langle a_{k_1} a_{k_2} a_{k_3}^* a_{k_4}^* \delta(\Delta_{k_1 k_2}) \rangle$$

to reveal the resonance structures manifested in the dynamics (1). Here $\delta$ equals 1 if $\Delta_{k_1 k_2}$ is a multiple of $N$ and 0 otherwise. This $\delta$, instead of the Dirac $\delta$, is used to account for the discrete approximation of Eq. (2). For $\beta = 8$, $|\mathcal{A}_{k_1 k_2 k_3 k_4}|$ is displayed in Fig. 2(f), whose comparison with Fig. 2(c) reveals an excellent agreement between the locations of the peaks (dark strips) of the longtime average and the loci of the resonances (6) determined by the renormalized $\tilde{\Omega}_k = \tilde{\Omega}_k$ or $\tilde{\Omega}_k$ (The WT theory would predict the resonance structures as in Fig. 2(a) for these cases). The physical picture derived from these results is that wave resonances are renormalized and they are governed by the renormalized $\tilde{\Omega}_k$. We note in passing that $\tilde{\Omega}_k = |k|^\alpha + \text{const}$ for NLS; therefore, its renormalized resonance structures should be the same as those predicted by WT theory, as is confirmed in our study.

We stress that both the nonlinearity parameter $\beta$ and the linear frequency exponent $\alpha$ play important roles in $\tilde{\Omega}_k$. In particular, if $\alpha > 1$ (for which there is no nontrivial fourwave resonances by $\omega_k = |k|^\alpha$, resonances controlled by $\tilde{\Omega}_k$ may arise if $0 < \beta/2 < 1$. Shown in Fig. 2(e) is such a result where new resonance structures for $\alpha = 2$, $\beta = 1$, are created. For comparison, the resonance structure (6) for $\omega_k = |k|^2$ is displayed in Fig. 2(d) which does not possess new resonant strips appearing in Fig. 2(e). This result shows that the nonlinearity renormalizes the linear dispersion relation to modify the resonance manifold, thereby creating new resonant interactions even when there would be no bare resonance as dictated by the linear dispersion relation. We note that there is a surprising similarity in the resonance structure between Figs. 2(b) and 2(e). This similarity arises because both $\Omega_k$ have the asymptotic form of $c_1 |k|^{1/2} + c_2 |k|^2$. The resonance structure of Fig. 2(b) is in a weak turbulence regime while Fig. 2(d) is in a strong nonlinear regime with $\mathcal{H}_k / \mathcal{H}_s \sim 1$.

The classical kinetic equation of WT theory [3] cannot be used to find the spectra with strong nonlinearities. Here,
we develop a WT-like theory for this regime based on the frequency renormalization derived above. Approximating $\langle |a_k(t)|^2 \rangle$ by $n_k(t) = \langle |a_k(t)|^2 \rangle_{\text{eff}}$, averaged over the Gibbs measure with the effective Hamiltonian $\mathcal{H}_{\text{eff}} = \mathcal{H}_{\text{eff}}^2 + \mathcal{H}_{\text{eff}}^3$, we can derive the following effective kinetic equation for $n_k(t)$:

$$\frac{\partial n_k(t)}{\partial t} = 4\pi \int \tilde{T}_{123k} U_{123k} \delta(\tilde{\Omega}_1, \tilde{\Omega}_2) \delta(\Delta_{k_1 k_2}) dk_{123}, \quad (7)$$

where $U_{123k} = n_k n_3 n_{k_1} (n_{k_1}^{-1} + n_{k_2}^{-1} - n_{k_3}^{-1} - n_{k_1}^{-1})$ and the interaction tensor $\tilde{T}_{123k} = T_{123k}$ if $k_1 \neq k_2$ and $k_3 \neq k$, and 0 otherwise. We immediately find $n_k = \theta/\tilde{\Omega}_k$ as a stationary solution to Eq. (7), since it makes the integrand vanish. This renormalized RJ distribution is consistent with the ZM prediction [Eq. (4)], but deviates from the classical RJ distribution $\langle |a_k|^2 \rangle = \theta/|k|^\alpha$ as predicted by WT theory using the bare Hamiltonian $\mathcal{H}$, especially for high $k$ and strong nonlinearity. As a verification of the validity of the effective kinetic equation (7), Fig. 3 shows that $\langle |a_k|^2 \rangle$ obtained numerically using time average from the original dynamics (2) in equilibrium agrees very well with the prediction $n_k = \theta/\tilde{\Omega}_k$.

The Kolmogorov-Zakharov nonequilibrium spectra [3] do not satisfy Eq. (7), since $\tilde{\Omega}_k$ no longer has a simple power law scaling as in the bare $\omega_k = |k|^\alpha$. For a driven-damped MMT system [13], our simulation reveals a bifurcation of the renormalized dispersion relation. In the weakly driven, damped system, the wave system is similar to the thermal equilibrium case, i.e., $n_k \sim 1/\Omega_k^R$ in the inertial range with the renormalized $\omega_k = \Omega_k^R$. For strong driving and damping, however, a new dispersion relation $\omega_k \sim |k|^\gamma$ with $\gamma \sim 0.55$ is observed for $\alpha = 1/2$. Furthermore, our numerical analysis shows that even in the driven, damped system, $\mathcal{A}_{k_1 k_2}$ matches well with the four-wave resonance structure (6) by its corresponding renormalized dispersion relation.

In conclusion, a new dynamical picture of WT emerges: The linear dispersion relation is effectively renormalized, allowing one to treat systems with strong nonlinearities. This renormalization can create new resonances that are not present in the bare resonances, giving rise to WT dynamics which cannot be captured by the classical WT theory. Going beyond the classical perturbative perspective of WT, our work has revealed a nonperturbative nature of WT with the spectrum $n_k$ of WT dynamics determined by an intertwining self-consistent process: The trivial resonant scatterings of waves off of background waves characterized by $n_k$ control the true, renormalized, dispersion relation. This renormalized dispersion relation, in turn, controls nontrivial resonances of the full dynamics, thus giving rise to a self-consistent wave spectrum $n_k$.

This work was supported by an NSF grant.

[12] The numerical simulation of the Hamiltonian system (2) represents a microcanonical ensemble for system (2). A symplectic algorithm is used [14].
[13] The system (2) is additionally forced by random noise at low $k$ and dissipated at both low and high $k$.